

1 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

2 -----X
JANELL WINFIELD, TRACEY STEWART,
3 SHAUNA NOEL, and EMMANUELLA SENAT,

4
PLAINTIFFS,

5
Case No.:
6 -against- 15-cv-05236
(LTS) (KHP)
7

8 CITY OF NEW YORK,

9 DEFENDANT.
-----X

10
11 DATE: July 30, 2018

12 TIME: 10:25 a.m.
13

14 EXAMINATION BEFORE TRIAL of the Plaintiff,
15 EMMANUELLA SENAT, taken by the Defendant, pursuant to a
16 Court Order and to the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure,
17 held at the offices of New York City Law Department,
18 100 Church Street, New York, New York 10007, before
19 Susan Pines, a Notary Public of the State of New York.
20
21
22
23
24
25

E. SENAT

1 amenities and how convenient they would be for you?

2 MS. WANG: Objection to the form.

3 A. I'm still confused about what you mean by
4 "everyday amenities."

5 Q. I'm trying to think of a what, that is clear
6 for everyone. Do you spend a lot of time in midtown
7 Manhattan or lower Manhattan?

8 A. What do you mean by "time"?

9 Q. Do you work in either of those locations?

10 A. No, I do not work in midtown or lower
11 Manhattan.

12 Q. Do you hang out with friends, or do a lot of
13 activities in those areas?

14 A. I don't keep track of how much time I spend in
15 lower or midtown, or even in Harlem.

16 Q. You were saying that those areas were areas
17 that you would potentially like to live in, so I'm
18 trying to understand how you come to know, how you have
19 come to understand what those areas are like?

20 A. If you're asking me my thought process about
21 why I prefer to live in lower Manhattan or midtown
22 Manhattan, I go out to eat in a lot of places in the
23 city, and if I see an area that I like, I happen to like
24 it and I would like to live there. I've lived in Harlem
25 since 2011, I've lived there for quite some time and

E. SENAT

1 there's other places in the city that I would like to
2 live in as well, and if I see a place that's attractive,
3 then I say I would like to live there too.

4 MS. POLIFIONE: We'll take a quick break.

5 (Whereupon, a short recess was taken.)

6 Q. You had said that your current neighborhood,
7 you considered it convenient?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. If your apartment was better maintained, if
10 you didn't have the problems that you were describing
11 before, would you consider staying in either that
12 apartment or that area?

13 MS. WANG: Objection.

14 A. I honestly prefer to live in lower and midtown
15 Manhattan. I believe lower and midtown Manhattan is
16 convenient just like Harlem, but I do like the
17 architecture there, I like the buildings, it's really
18 nice, it's touristy, so you get a lot of different
19 shopping malls and centers. I just like the atmosphere
20 down there.

21 Q. Is there a specific neighborhood within lower
22 Manhattan or midtown that you like?

23 A. I don't have a specific neighborhood in lower
24 to midtown Manhattan. I just feel like as you go into
25 lower and midtown Manhattan there's more architecture,

E. SENAT

1 2914 and 2915. Do you recognize this document?

2 A. You said there's a 2940?

3 Q. Yes, it's the fourth page, the back of the
4 third page, there should be three sheets of paper.

5 A. Yes.

6 MS. WANG: We haven't ever seen it with two
7 Bates stamps, I don't know why it's doing that, or
8 it's the way you printed it. When we pulled it up,
9 we didn't have two Bates stamps.

10 MS. POLIFIONE: It might just have been the
11 way we print out, because my understanding is that
12 the one Bates number is the lead number, so you can
13 tell what's the file.

14 Q. So you recognize this document?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. Can you describe what this document is?

17 A. This is for, I believe, Alvista Towers
18 lottery, it's for Sutphin Boulevard in Jamaica, Queens.
19 I had applied for this, I don't recall when I applied
20 for it, and they had reached out to me for an interview
21 and I decided to cancel the interview.

22 Q. What was the reason for canceling your
23 interview for this project?

24 A. I canceled this interview because some of the
25 affordable housing apartments that are being built, I

E. SENAT

1 feel like they're being built in areas that are not so
2 great, even though the apartments are really nice and
3 with really nice luxuries, and this location happens to
4 be one of them. Although it had really nice amenities
5 and I've lived in several parts of Queens I was debating
6 on and off whether or not to apply. I said, let me go
7 ahead, not thinking I would be called because it was in
8 Queens, and lo and behold, I was called.

9 Q. What about this area where this project was,
10 was undesirable to you?

11 A. Sutphin Boulevard, to me, I don't deem it to
12 be very safe for myself since I would be living alone as
13 a female, and I get out of work late, I just didn't
14 think it would be safe for me to be traveling at certain
15 times of night in that particular area.

16 Q. Have you spent time in that area?

17 MS. WANG: Objection.

18 A. As in if I lived in that area?

19 Q. How did you come to the idea that this area
20 was unsafe?

21 A. I spent most of my life living in Queens, so
22 I've lived in certain parts of Queens, and I would go to
23 Sutphin Boulevard sometimes to meet friends, or I would
24 go there to get my hair done, so I'm very familiar with
25 the area as in passing through, I've never lived in

E. SENAT

C E R T I F I C A T E

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

STATE OF NEW YORK)
 : SS.:
COUNTY OF NEW YORK)

I, SUSAN PINES, a Notary Public for and within the
State of New York, do hereby certify:

That the witness whose examination is hereinbefore
set forth was duly sworn and that such examination is a
true record of the testimony given by that witness.

I further certify that I am not related to any of
the parties to this action by blood or by marriage and
that I am in no way interested in the outcome of this
matter.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand
this 3rd day of August 2018.



SUSAN PINES

Corrections to Emmanuella Senat's Deposition Transcript:

4:10:

Change from: "West 144th Street"

To: "110 West 144th Street"

4:18:

Change from: "you she."

To: "you."

8:20:

Change from: "Margery"

To: "Marjorie"

9:12:

Change from: "Kasimir"

To: "Casimir"

24:20:

Change from: "grandma, which"

To: "grandma, who"

34:2:

Change from: "things so see"

To: "things to see"

58:25:

Change from "I heard about the online."

To: "I heard about the online option."

65:1:

Change from: "they next time"

To: "the next time"

65:24:

Change from: "I was said okay"

To: "I said okay"

68:17:

Change from: "going"

To: "going on?"

73:21:

Change from: "that's what thought the"

To: "that's what I thought the"

73:25:

Change from: "It was just fair"

To: "It was just unfair"

74:23-24

Change from: "because I was called it."

To: "because I was called in."

79:12:

Change from: "sufficient for you are to move"

To: "sufficient for you to move"

82:24:

Change from: "Central Haarlem"

To: "Central Harlem"

97:5:

Change from: "I wish it was more than diverse"

To: "I wish it was more diverse"

99:13:

Change from: "if should be mixed"

To: "it should be mixed"

102:8:

Change from: "I like it's predominantly Caucasian."

To: "I feel like it's predominantly Caucasian."

103:20:

Change from: "weeks or months before seeing the clip and reaching"

To: "weeks or months between seeing the clip and reaching"

112:24:

Change from: "it's not go to happen"

To: "it's not going to happen"

121:8:

Change from: "single female living my myself"

To: "single female living by myself"

121:11:

Change from: "that's it's"

To: "that it's"

127:21:

Change from: "understood it as her to saying"

To: "understood it as her to be saying"

128:11:

Change from: "a while lot"

To: "a whole lot"

131:2:

Change from: "it wasn't too from me"

To: "it wasn't too far from me"

140:21-22:

Change from: "focussing"

To: "focusing" (x2)

143:14:

Change from: "I say that the all the time"

To: "I say that all the time"

154:2:

Change from: "for a while"

To: "for a whole"

154:20:

Change from: "focussing"

To: "focusing"

158:2:

Change from: "Sometimes"

To: "sometimes"

160:19:

Change from: "wherever that they please."

To: "wherever they please."

161:21-22:

Change from: "I'm damned if I'm not going to stop applying for lower or midtown Manhattan."

To: "I'm damned if I'm going to stop applying for lower or midtown Manhattan."

166:22:

Change from: "they'll get on equal opportunity"

To: "they'll get an equal opportunity"